

Kelso Camera Club

Process for selecting images for inter-club photographic competitions

Author: Nick Prior

Date 19th January 2016

This process document describes the way a selection panel is set up, and provides an indication of how it works when choosing images to represent the club in competitions. It is to be read in conjunction with the KCC Competition Images Criteria document which provides a framework for deciding between images.

It should be emphasised this process is specifically for selecting pictures for club competitions for which there are particular expectations, not least is the fact there is usually only one judge on the day with his/her own preferences and experiences.

It is not intended to be a process for identifying the “best” pictures, only the ones with least failings when viewed in the light of a competition.

Members whose images are not chosen should not feel their pictures are in any way inferior to those that are.

The objective of this written process is to act as a brief for Selection Panel members, and to ensure that the selection process as a whole is as transparent as is possible. It should also be seen as meeting part of the Club's educational objectives where critiquing one's own and others' pictures is seen as a crucial element of improving one's own photography. As highlighted earlier, it is not intended this process be followed slavishly. The Selection Panel may well agree to vary the detail of the process depending on the time available and other constraints.

The Selection Panel

The selection panel will consist of 4 members, one of whom is the Competition Secretary who will act as the Chair. The other Panel members will consist of 2 experienced members with at least some experience of selecting images for competitions, judging photographic competitions or experience of critiquing photographs, plus a further member with less experience. It is intended that the fourth member will see participation in the Panel as a way of developing their own photography through the critiquing process.

The Competition Secretary will seek volunteers for the Panel at the beginning of each annual session. The Committee will approve the Panel membership. The Panel members will be announced to the Club at one of the Thursday meetings.

The Competition Secretary will be authorised to appoint replacement Panel members in the case of original members pulling out.

Each member of the Panel will have an equal say in the selection of images. The Chair will however have a casting vote in the case of deadlock between the Panel members.

The KCC Committee will empower the Panel with the task of selecting images for the competitions for which they are appointed. The Panel will have the final say in deciding which images go forward to competitions.

Selecting images

The Selection Panel will refer to the Selection Criteria document during their various deliberations, and will use their judgement as to which images should go forward.

Members of the Club will upload images for consideration to whichever shared storage system is current for the annual session. Currently this is Google Drive, details of which are available on request.

The Selection Process Summarised

1. Each member chooses their candidate images (not their own)
2. Any images chosen by all 4 selectors go on Short List
3. Each member votes (Yes/No/Maybe) and comments on Long List of remaining images (but not on their own)
4. Long list is collated, scored (Yes=2, Maybe=1) and sorted in order of score
5. Images are added to the short list in order of score until there are enough or more than enough on the short list.
6. The critical and only mandatory stage. The Panel is convened for the Final Selection Discussion held face to face to review the list and to resolve outstanding issues:
 1. Check that the selection complies with the maximum allowed images per person
 2. To decide between images with the same score if the list is too long
 3. Finally, to “sense check” the entire list to ensure the process has not obscured an obvious candidate image.
7. The final selection is announced to the Club as a whole. Positive feedback is offered during that announcement highlighting the reasons why each image has been selected. Individual feedback will be on offer to all members on a one-to-one basis to discuss how their images fared in the selection.
8. After each competition, feedback will be given to the Club as a whole on how the images were received, what comments the judge made and where possible to view some of the other clubs' entries.

In more detail:

Stage 1 – Each member chooses their candidate images

Each Panel member will select as many images as they please from the images on the shared storage system for further consideration. This will be done individually without conferring with colleagues on the Panel and passed in a list to the Chair for collation. Panel members will not select their own images; if a selector's image is chosen by the other 3 panel members, it would normally be added to the shortlist for further consideration.

Stage 2 - Unanimously chosen images go on Short List

The Chair collates the list. Any image appearing on all four lists is added to the short list without further discussion. The remaining images are added to the Long List.

If any Club member has more than the minimum number of images on the short list at this stage, the images are left on the short list for consideration in the Final Selection Discussion.

Usually this will not produce sufficient images to meet the requirements so proceed to the next stage. If in the unlikely event of there being too many images, proceed immediately to the Final Selection Discussion.

Stage 3 – Each member votes and comments on Long List of remaining images

The Chair then circulates the Long List typically in a spreadsheet and invites Panel members to indicate Yes, Maybe or No to each image on the list. They will not vote on their own images. Each member will also add a short comment about each one, usually a brief note about why the image should or should not be selected. At the Chair's discretion, this can be done as a round robin with successive members seeing the previous

member's comments (which may be helpful for the fourth Panel member), or as a discrete exercise for each member.

The notes made by Panel members will remain private within the Panel.

Stage 4 - Long list is scored (Yes=2, Maybe=1) and sorted in order of score

The Long List ends up with the Chair who again collates the list.

Stage 5 - Images are added to the short list in order of score

The Chair adds images with successively lower scores to the short list. The process stops at the point where there are at least enough images on the shortlist.

For example, if we still looking for 5 images to complete the short list, and there are 7 images with the same score still unselected, they will all be added to the Short List and discussed in the next stage.

Stage 6 - The Panel is convened for the Final Selection Discussion

This discussion is held face to face to review the list and to resolve outstanding issues:

Are there too many images per person?

Decide which of the last images added to the Short List are to be retained.

Finally, run through the entire list and confirm that there are no obvious disregarded candidate images which should be preferred.

Stage 7 - The final selection is announced to the Club as a whole.

Positive feedback is offered during the announcement highlighting the reasons why each image has been selected. Individual feedback will be on offer to all members on a one-to-one basis to discuss how their images fared in the selection. The notes made by each Panel member will remain confidential to the Panel but might be used sensitively (and anonymously) during one-to-one feedback conversations.

Stage 8 – Feedback after each competition

Feedback will be given to the Club as a whole on how the images were received, what comments the judge made and where possible to view some of the other clubs' entries.